

President Dan Kaman called the meeting to order at 5 p.m. Kim Nuesse gave the **Invocation**, followed by the **Pledge of Allegiance**.

The Clerk **called the roll** and the following Commissioners responded: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton.

Upon motion of Pervis Brown and second of Kim Nuesse, the Commission approved the minutes of the April 12, 2010 meeting and dispensed with the oral reading of the minutes. All Ayes. The President declared the motion passed.

Dan Kaman read a **Proclamation on behalf of American Bikers Aimed Toward Education (ABATE) of Ohio declaring May, 2010 as Motorcycle Awareness Month in the City of Sandusky**. Brian Jordan of ABATE was in attendance to accept the Proclamation.

Kim Nuesse read a **Proclamation declaring May 1, 2010 as Arbor Day in the City of Sandusky**.

John Hamilton read a **Proclamation declaring April 26, 2010 as Edward A. Widman Day** as this is the last City Commission meeting before his (Ed's) retirement. Dave Waddington presented Ed Widman with golf balls and a lifetime pass for Mills Creek Golf Course on behalf of the Sandusky City Commissioners.

Dan Kaman said Jeff Krabill, a member of the Sandusky School Board, is in attendance to provide information about **green energy**. Dave Waddington said he, Julie Farrar and Jeff Krabill will be meeting with Sure Energy later this week to discuss **a possible collaboration with the Sandusky City Schools**. Jeff Krabill, 300 East Water Street, said he is here on behalf of himself personally and on the school district's behalf as they are also looking at wind turbines and has had the opportunity to speak with Dave Waddington. He said if both (the city and the schools) are looking at this and are serving the same audience, perhaps we could be looking in a joint way to bring economic efficiencies and provide this benefit to the community. He said these discussions may lead to a decision to go in separate directions, but working jointly may be better. Jeff Krabill said he came to make this public statement about having a meeting, seeing where it leads and then providing more information to City Commissioners and School Board members.

Under **Audience Participation**, the following persons offered their comments:

John Ginty, 5055 Providence Drive, asked who would be responsible for the Shoreline Park (restroom) facility on the days when staff from Double S Industries is not there. John Ginty asked about the Cold Creek bridge replacement on Bardshar Road; he said the old water main was taken out and we are now putting one in and it is a very expensive project. He asked why we are boring underneath the creek to run water lines rather than just attaching them to the existing bridge. John Ginty said the city recently concluded negotiations with the fire and police unions and this is an opportunity to get out of providing physical examinations for Fire Fighters and Police Officers to save money and he would rather hire a person back than provide these tests. He also stated this item should be bid out as it is over \$10,000.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, asked if the Commissioners were still having a Public Hearing for the 2010 Annual Plan. Dan Kaman said it is next on the Agenda.

Dennis Timple, 553 Bimini Drive, said he has serious concerns about Item #3 as it is under Section 14 (emergency legislation). He said this is an annual expense and should not have been requested as an emergency. He said the cost of \$702 per officer could be lower if handled through the employees' health insurance by paying their deductible and with their own individual physicians. Dennis Timple said there are six road officers not being tested and to consider laying these officers off and rehiring six who can work the road. He also commented on the 3/12-hour shifts and suggested switching to a 40-hour workweek so that officers and not be as tired and the city will gain 4 hours x 35 people or 140 more hours. If 12-hour shifts were so efficient, everyone would be working them across the country. He asked the Commissioners to table this item and review the situation.

The President opened **the Public Hearing regarding the 2010 Annual Plan**. Carrie Handy said the purpose of the Public Hearing is to present proposed projects for the FY 2010, Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) program. She said the city received good news from HUD last

week that our 2010 allocation will be \$892,031 which is \$72,000 more than last year. She distributed copies of the program and projects available and then outlined the projects proposed with the city's 2010 funding:

- 1) Administration includes staff time, part of the new Assistant Planner position, Information and Referral (2-1-1) services and support for fair housing activities which is contracted through WSOS.
- 2) Housing programs to continue include \$5,000 in down payment assistance for income-qualified persons, emergency home repair and accessibility improvements up to \$8,000 which is contracted through Erie Huron CAC and the downtown building improvement program. Carrie Handy said one downtown property owner applied for these monies last year and a portion is being carried over to complete the project; there is no new money for this year.
- 3) Public Services include community wellness prevention with the Erie County Health Department (ECHD). The ECHD provides health education and prevention programs to persons in low to moderate income neighborhoods; a drug repository program for seniors; emergency housing and utility assistance as administered by the Volunteers of America; the citizens circle program is administered by Center for Cultural Awareness and part of the Weed and Seed grant; scholarships to participate in youth recreational programs (up to \$50) for low to moderate income kids who would not otherwise be able to participate in our recreation programs.
- 4) Public Facilities & Improvements include three street projects: Hayes Avenue, Meigs Street and Cedar Point Drive. This also covers improvements at Lions Park (shoreline work), Huron Park (Master Plan and new play equipment) and small improvements to other parks. It is proposed to install two small portions of the Sandusky Bay Pathway.
- 5) Other includes monies for staff in Code Enforcement and monies for clearance and demolition.
- 6) Economic Development includes RLF monies for for-profit companies, economic development assistance provided to the city by Greg Sherman and monies for the Micro-Enterprise Loan Program.

Dan Kaman asked if the Commissioners had any questions. Dave Waddington asked if counseling was being provided for persons who receive first time homebuyer assistance and Carrie Handy said this is part of the requirement to get the money. Dave Waddington asked if we could get Greg Sherman more involved and Carrie Handy said there are limits for spending RLF monies as only 20% of the income earned during each year generated can be spent for assistance. Dave Waddington asked if we would be applying to the state even if we are not going to be eligible for CHIP money from HUD and Carrie Handy said we probably will not be eligible for 3 years; we applied for 2009 and we need to do this two more times before we would be eligible. Julie Farrar said the monies available for home repairs are administered by the Erie Huron CAC but they are currently backed up and still working on the 2009 repairs. She said interested persons should get their applications in right away so that they get in line for processing. Julie Farrar asked Carrie Handy to provide notice of the Citizen Circle graduation so that this date can be added to her (and others) calendar. Julie Farrar asked if the loans for businesses for heating and cooling improvements were companies which were turned down by a bank. Carrie Handy said this is GAP financing and Greg Sherman can explain it to the requestor.

Dan Kaman asked if any **members of the audience wished to comment for the Public Hearing:**

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said we have used up most of our street money with Hayes Avenue and asked if more neighborhood streets could be done instead of our main streets. Carrie Handy said these monies were not used for Hayes Avenue in 2008 or 2009 and that Meigs Street is being done and is in an identified targeted neighborhood. Sharon Johnson said she sees a lot of money going into the parks and asked about putting some of this into our streets. Carrie Handy said the City Commissioners can make that decision. Sharon Johnson asked if we were allowed to have a carryover and Carrie Handy said we can carry over no more than 1.5 times of our annual allocation without penalty. Sharon Johnson said she did not see anything slated for 2010 in demolition but there is a carryover. Carrie Handy said some money is to be used to pay for our last round of demolition projects and there is still money in our NSP for demolition and she estimates there will be 20 or 21 houses demolished by the county as submitted by the city. We should be able to take down 8 – 10 houses with the money we have available.

Diedre Cole, 807 Hancock Street, said Carrie Handy has done a fantastic job but she (Diedre) has a personal concern about the allocation of only \$1,000 toward youth and recreational programs and is a little put off. She said the City Commission recently gave permission to make a request for funding from one of the local foundations for the "Take the Kids Fishing Derby" and there are several organizations which consistently benefit our children, but we do not do all that we should do.

There being no further comments, **Dan Kaman declared the Public Hearing closed.**

Jim Arthur, 1104 Erie Boulevard, then made a presentation on behalf of the Sandusky City Tree Commission. Jim Arthur said members of the Tree Commission recently attended the Ohio Division of Forestry's Tree Commission Academy and provided an overview of the 64 hours of training and education. He said stress should be placed on the important investment of trees in a community and how trees increase in value. Jim Arthur said this was the first Academy of its kind in the nation and Sandusky was the first graduating class in Ohio and included Jim Arthur, Tom Speir, Cynthia Ball, John Parker and Joe Viviano. As a senior project, these persons developed a Master Plan for a four – block area in the city. He said the area of Huron Avenue South to Monroe Street was considered for an intense Master Plan and the creation of "Allee" along this area of Huron Avenue. He said a good example of an Allee would be the area of 50th Street where the trees arch over the street. Jim Arthur said a \$50,000 grant application was submitted for the Emerald Ash Borer program and credited Tom Speir who did most of the work in putting this together. He said Sandusky is no longer ahead of the curve with these removals and are requesting additional help from the State of Ohio. Members of the Sandusky City Tree Commission are also working on a tree inventory and a rewrite of Section 917 the Code of Ordinances dealing with urban trees and the Tree Commission. He closed by giving a message about volcano mulching of trees which is a death sentence for the tree as it virtually strangles life from the tree. Jim Arthur said there are numerous Arbor Day events and a tree planting ceremony this weekend at the Greenhouse. Dan Kaman thanked Jim Arthur and the other members of the Tree Commission and city staff for their assistance. He said the Forestry Division is operating with fewer employees and prioritizing their tasks.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Pervis Brown, the Commission voted to accept all communications. All Ayes. The President declared the motion passed.

ITEM #1 – Submitted by Michele Hall, Recreation Program Supervisor

Budgetary Information: The agreements will not result in any additional budgetary expenses. The city will benefit from the agreed upon service of restroom cleaning and restocking to be done by Double S Industries.

ORDINANCE NO. 10-036: It is requested an Ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to **enter into an Agreement with Double S Industries, Inc., (d.b.a. Bay Area Bike Rentals) for the Shoreline Park concession stand beginning May 31, 2010, through September 6, 2010;** and declaring that this Ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon on motion of Pervis Brown and second of Kim Nuesse, the Commission authorized the passage of this Ordinance in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Dave Waddington said the Shoreline Park concession will be open from May 31 – September 6 from 10 a.m. – 6 p.m. He said during other dates and timeframes, city staff will be available for maintenance purposes.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Motion passed. Roll Call on the Ordinance: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Ordinance passed.

ITEM #2 – Submitted by Kathryn K. McKillips, Engineer

Budgetary Information: The revised project cost based on bids, including engineering, inspection, advertising and miscellaneous expenses is \$59,763. The city is responsible for the entire project cost, and it will be paid with Water Funds.

ORDINANCE NO. 10-037: It is requested an Ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to **award a contract to Speer Bros., Inc., of Sandusky, Ohio, for the Bardshar Road Water Main at Cold Creek project;** and declaring that this Ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon on motion of Dave Waddington and second of Pervis Brown, the Commission authorized the passage of this Ordinance in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Julie Farrar asked if Kathy McKillips could explain why this cannot be tied into the old bridge. Kathy McKillips said the original main was attached to the old bridge and the city was notified (by the county) of the bridge replacement just prior to its being bid. She said we had to make a quick decision for an alternative to either attach the main to the bridge or to bore under Cold Creek and not rely on the county's bridge to support it. She said a decision was made so as to not end up in the same situation as we did last summer when we had to cut into a section of water main which was in good condition because of the replacement of a bridge which the city did not own. Kathy McKillips said we had wanted to prevent this from happening again in the future.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Motion passed. Roll Call on the Ordinance: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Ordinance passed.

ITEM #3 – Submitted by Charlie Sams, Interim Chief of Police

Budgetary Information: Firelands Regional Medical Center (FRMC) is the sole provider of contractually required annual testing for police officers within the City of Sandusky. Having the tests performed within the city allows police officers to be tested while on duty and, therefore, avoids the additional expense of overtime. There are 35 employees that are eligible for physicals at a cost not to exceed \$24,517.50. The cost for the exams was included in the Police Department's 2010 budget. **ORDINANCE NO.10-038:** It is requested an Ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to **expend funds to Firelands Corporate Health Center of Sandusky, Ohio, for annual physicals, drug screens, chest x-rays and treadmill stress tests to be completed for the Sandusky Police Department in CY 2010;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon on motion of Brett Fuqua and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission authorized the passage of this Ordinance in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Kim Nuesse said this is a contractual item and if changed, it would be done through the negotiation process in the future.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Motion passed. Roll Call on the Ordinance: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Ordinance passed.

ITEM #4 – Submitted by Carrie Handy, Chief Planner

Budgetary Information: The cost of this contract is covered by FY 2009 Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Program funds not to exceed \$22,500. There will be no impact on the City's General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO.10-039: It is requested an Ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to **enter into an agreement for professional design services with the Collaborative Inc., for the Lions Park project;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon on motion of Brett Fuqua and second of Pervis Brown, the Commission authorized the passage of this Ordinance in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Dave Waddington said the reason this is being passed under Section 14 is to ensure the completion of shoreline construction work by September.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Motion passed. Roll Call on the Ordinance: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Ordinance passed.

CITY MANAGER'S REPORT

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Brett Fuqua, the Commission voted to accept a donation of equipment (air storage cart, hoses and cylinders) used for confined space operations from the Huron Fire Division to the Sandusky Fire Department. All Ayes. The President declared the motion passed.

Don Icsman notified the Commission of a **grant received from the Sandusky Erie County Community Foundation, in the amount of \$1,391.65, for the purchase of 50 fishing poles, 50 tackle boxes and 50 packs of lures and hooks to be distributed to the participants of the Take the Kids Fishing Fun Day event.**

Don Icsman notified the Commission of a **grant application submitted to the Ohio Lake Erie Commission for the Lake Erie Protection Fund for a FY 2010 Small Grant for assistance with the shoreline restoration work in Lions Park. He said the grant is for \$15,000 and will be matched with \$110,000 in CDBG Funds which have been budgeted for and are available. He said the grant application deadline was April 22, 2010.**

Don Icsman said a **request has been made by Acting Chief Charlie Sams and Sgt. John Orzech to attend the FBI National Training Academy Conference in Boston, Massachusetts. He said this training will take place from July 24 – July 28, 2010 and all costs will be paid by Acting Chief Charlie Sams and Sgt. John Orzech. Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Brett Fuqua, the Commission voted to allow for this out-of-state travel. All Ayes. The President declared the motion passed.**

Don Icsman notified the Commission that the **Fifth Third Bank eBus will be parked at the Jackson Street parking lot on Wednesday, May 26, 2010 from 2 p.m. – 8 p.m. offering financial and home ownership education for customers and for the general public as a community service.**

Don Icsman said although he and Ed Widman have not always agreed, it was his (Don's) pleasure to work with Ed Widman.

Kim Nuesse asked about training **for the employees about the legislative process** and Don Icsman said this has been scheduled for next Tuesday.

OLD BUSINESS

Dave Waddington said the city will be hosting a **tire recycling event** at City Hall from 9 a.m. – 1 p.m. with a limit of four tires per resident with identification. Dave Waddington said this Saturday (8 a.m. – 5 p.m.) and Sunday (10 a.m. - 4 p.m.), residents will have the opportunity to **drop off their yard waste at Barnes Nursery at no charge.**

Dave Waddington mentioned the **WSBA Gator Classic Pro Am Fishing Tournament** taking place this weekend at the city's boat launch facility.

Julie Farrar said she and Kim Nuesse spoke before the meeting about the **proposal made for a Comprehensive Analysis by ICMA.** She said this item was tabled and is willing to wait and see what happens, but said we should not forget about our recent Public Protection Classification (PPC) rating which was a 4, nor the recent International Organization for Standardization (ISO) report. She said our rating could have been a 3 if not for our inability to take three engines to every fire and the city not having enough staff or training. She said in spite of staffing and training issues, we have responded to every call even though we hear about our "downtime" and about changing shifts or hours. Julie Farrar said in a study from 2004, 37% of people who died in house fires died in the middle of the night and had a working smoke detector. She said even though this is considered "downtime" and we are not responding to a call, it does not mean that they (Police Officers and/or Fire Fighters) do not need to be there or that we do not need protection. She said insurance rates are lower in Sandusky because of our response times and to keep an eye on this to help with future economic development as well as protection for structures and families in the city. Julie Farrar said past ICMA studies have recommended several things from changing the hours worked to cross-training Police and Fire personnel and believes this would be a whole big beehive to now look at contracts and consider training Police Officers to be Fire Fighters or other tasks that may fall under an AFSCME job description. She said she believes Fire Fighters could check fire hydrants, but not

other things. She said a city in New Jersey recommended their Police Department be certified under the Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies (CALEA). She said CALEA deals with issues of doing more with less and we talk about best practices and things that we want such as good service for our residents but we cannot go down further. She said that she is not saying we should **not** look into ICMA, but if we could pay a fee at the beginning (\$22,900) to be accredited with CALEA or CPSE and then pay \$5,000 each year thereafter to continue, this will address a lot of issues the Commissioners want addressed to provide top notch services. She said she understands under Chief Runner's command, we had started to work on this and Acting Chief Sams is already a certified manager for CALEA. Julie Farrar said streamlining and making this investment would be good and give us more points for our PPC rating and that this certification and is a cheaper route to go down. She said this would bring us up to speed on the services we are providing and we should not lose sight of different options. She is willing to listen to any presentation or research that is performed.

Dave Waddington said after the last meeting, Julie Farrar held this report up like it was a data comparison and he has since met with Assistant Chief Sams, Acting Chief Paul Ricci and Don Icsman and dug through the 2004 Citizen Survey. He said there was one meeting on January 6, 2007, and the problem he had with the ICMA's Center for Performance Measurement (CPM) is he wanted to see more Ohio comparisons from cities like Lorain, Marion, Fremont or Mansfield. He said the data in 2004 is about the same six years later. He said Don Icsman and Ed Widman told him this was the first time they had seen this book and there was only one meeting that he knew of about it. He said Mike Will was going to get back with the Commissioners after looking at more regional comparisons and he (Dave) did his due diligence looking up this information. He said he also had a problem with the cost for CPM, \$19,400, because it did not come before the City Commission but was broken down and piecemealed out. He said this was over \$10,000 and should have come before the City Commission. He asked Paul Ricci what was presented as far as the data comparisons. Paul Ricci said the distinction between data collection and a study is sometimes a matter of semantics. He said a study is defined as a review of research and analysis of information, facts or data to determine a course of action or a plan. The 2006 report is a collection and comparison of the participating governmental entities and one item that speaks volumes about its usefulness is that it was reviewed locally and in-house recommendations were developed for improvements in service. Paul Ricci said there is a caution in the data that careful consideration should be given to characteristics of a service, a program, a department or jurisdiction that affects performance. Attention should also be paid to explanatory information accompanying each graph and data to the reporting jurisdictions. He said whenever possible, performance information should be linked specifically to related citizen and customer feedback which was done; there are also Commission priorities, strategic plan objectives and budget targets to be met and regardless what it presents, it is recommended all things are looked at to determine a course of action or a plan.

Kim Nuesse said she was out of town during the last City Commission meeting but said she had some information to share with the Commissioners and the public. She is very familiar with CALEA and managed the process for two years in the Columbus area and agrees this would be very good to implement on a long-term basis, but it should be understood that it is not an overnight process and the agency must be assessed. She said she and Paul Ricci have discussed this, and plan to discuss it further, as she is the liaison to the Fire Department. She is in agreement that this should be done, however, this is separate and not what she was bringing before the Commission; rather she was bringing before the City Commission our falling revenues as the latest figures are at 10% and not increasing. She said in light of this, some reorganization was done by Don Icsman in collaboration with the Department Heads and staff from Administrative Services. She said they did a wonderful job in-house of assessing different job descriptions and realigning duties to avoid duplication of services. She said we have done things to cut costs, to streamline operations and this has resulted in being more efficient and effective. She said she got back into town and understands there has been a lot of discussion about \$2.4 million and said that people need to understand this is not extra money; it is our emergency reserve to allow us to operate if anything happens and our revenues drop further. She said this money cannot be used to bring back more employees nor can it be used to bring back more services. She said she recommended doing an assessment, which people are referring to as a study. An active assessment would be performed in a three-month period to look at our safety services which take up almost 75% of our current general operating budget. We will consider ways to more effectively align and streamline services, look at staffing to see where we can save money and implement recommendations to provide more effective service delivery to better serve residents and aid the Police and Fire Departments, including dispatch operations. She said this would be a workload assessment as every police and fire department has a number of emergency and non-emergency calls. Emergency calls are about 30% – 50% of those received while the remaining non-emergency calls are reprioritized with recommendations from professionals for ways to reprioritize and determine ways to deliver service and help during this time of cutbacks to be

more efficient according to the city's priorities. This would in no way affect our emergency calls and operations. Kim Nuesse said at the same time, based upon this in-depth workload assessment, we could get an objective look at staffing recommendations. She has no preconceived notions about what staffing levels the study would recommend as it would be unique to our community and geographical area. She said there has been much pushback from the unions and said there is a lot of fear going on and if someone was going to talk with one commissioner, they need to talk to all commissioners. She said Julie Farrar has been targeted by union people to bring up this information to undermine the City Manager, the City Commissioners and other departments and she (Kim) does not appreciate this. She said it is unfair to the community and to the City Commissioners and is irresponsible. She said she got back into town only to see that we have a gang issue which the Police Department has been addressing for a couple of years; it was not just discovered overnight. Charlie Sams said he was responding to a question from Dave Waddington about the gang issue getting much worse since February. Kim Nuesse said this is not a problem that just happened and people in the community are calling her suggesting that we are not responding and that they are considering moving out of town or moving their business out of town. She asked Charlie Sams if this is what he was saying and he said he was not. Kim Nuesse said if he had been, that would be irresponsible and the City Commissioners would not stand for it. She said safety forces are going to respond to calls for service in this community whether laid off or not. She would like to see an assessment of these services so the remaining safety services can be efficient and run effectively for the community and that she is not talking about **not** responding to problems. She said she encourages the police to present ideas on how to address this issue to calm the fears in the community. She said the commissioners and staff are working hard to try and bring residents and businesses into the community and that this kind of fear and panic is not acceptable and is unrealistic. She said if she has to do presentations over and over with different companies to lie out a scope of services she will and thinks spending \$63,000 to save \$1 million or even a few hundred thousand dollars is an investment and she is willing to look at ways to pay for it. She plans to come back in a couple of weeks with other comparable companies and assessments and ways to fund them. She is not willing to dance around the issue and act like the elephant is not in the room. She said we have to make good, logical and factual decisions that are not based on emotion to move forward; in spite of an economic downturn, there are not increasing revenues and we have to live within our means and work with what we have and this is what she proposed. She said there are some logical questions from the City Commissioners and from the public and will address them in a couple of weeks. She said once all proposals are presented with ways to pay for them, the City Commissioners can make an informed decision and stated there are things that are going on that are very disturbing and she is not willing to sit here and support them.

Julie Farrar said she has spent an eight-hour shift with both the Sandusky Fire and Police Department and asked how many of the City Commissioners have done this. She said she is sorry if anyone feels like she is trying to undermine them but the same people who elected her have contacted her feel the same way she does; the bottom line is - they do not want to pay \$63,500 for another study. She said we can find other funding, but grant money is still public money. She thinks Charlie Sams and Paul Ricci are educated and we can get this information and take care of these things like other communities have done. She said other communities have wanted to create a Public Safety Director's position and asked how the public would feel if we did this while cutting bodies downtown. A lot of other recommendations could be made which would cross the line on jurisdiction of jobs. She said we are a public entity and have to deal with contracts whether we like it or not and they were just ratified. She said this should have been done before going to the bargaining table with the unions. She suggested that the commissioners spend some time with our Police Officers and Fire Fighters and watch them on the job. She said she has walked into all three fire stations and did not catch anyone having coffee, she caught them in training. She said when she was on a shift, they had six calls that night and these ladies and gentlemen know what they are doing. When she rode with the Police Officer, there were a couple of situations where she could not get out of the car but they were not out twiddling their thumbs. Whether information comes from "Joe Blow" or someone on the Department, it is her job to get the information to make an informed decision. She said the \$63,000 price tag was what got her thinking and said that maybe we should consider CALEA or an accreditation or certification process to address the issues. She said we have been doing more with less and have already done some things. She said people do not want another study and there are expert people here who know what it takes. She said we have already made some of the recommendations given to the City of Huron and we were not told by ICMA to do them. She said the people that she represents do not want another study; it is not a union thing, it is her as a Commissioner and a taxpayer and we have plenty of experienced people who know what it takes to get the job done. The population of Westwood, NJ is 41,908 which was supposed to be unique to us but they have a rental population of only 16%. Their average resident age is 40 years, their average income is \$105,000 - \$300,000/year and an average home is \$300,000; they are an up-

and-coming community. We have a very minute population that lives this type of lifestyle in Sandusky and she said she thinks we should do the study ourselves and believes the residents would appreciate it. She said she is sorry if anyone feels she is stepping on their toes, but she is just doing her job.

Brett Fuqua said initially, he was not going to say anything about this, he has done his own homework and does not wish to rehash what Julie Farrar or Dave Waddington have said. He said this is not a union issue and we have professionals in our Police and Fire Departments and they are microcosms of our society, although not perfect. He said there are people in our society who do things for their personal interest but he does not believe that the majority of those in our Police or Fire Departments are. He said recently we have been using the word "union" like it is a dirty word it is not; he comes from a unionism background had a lot of support from people in the unions when elected. He said the unions are not against this because of being in fear for their jobs because 95% of the population is afraid for their jobs now. He said initially he was in support of the ICMA study but after doing his research, it would take a biblical revelation to vote to accept it. He does not care what research is done or what comes back to this table, he is making a statement now that he is not voting for a \$62,000 study as we cannot afford it and it is not personal against anyone. He said there are men and women in Sandusky within these organizations who could do a study just as well and it would be professional and unbiased.

Dave Waddington said he feels like he has been pulled through a keyhole. He said after the last meeting, he left confused and upset about the gang problem. He talked with Acting Chief Sams last week, works at the high school, is active in the community and wonders if the Commission should have known about this a little sooner. If it has been going on since February, he asked how about last month. If there is an increased activity and we need help, there has to be some mechanism in place for all seven commissioners to know as he had no idea it had gotten to this level. When asked about three shootings, John Orzech said two, he (Dave) said three and he still does not know what this number is as far as the gang shootings. Charlie Sams said they were in the middle of negotiations and to have asked publicly for additional manpower and to have come in during these negotiations would have caused an unfair labor practice charge. There were three local shootings by this group and the first one was in mid-February. He did not want to run into the meeting after the first one and say they had a shooting; just prior to the last meeting, there was a third shooting. He then went to Don Icsman and advised him of his fears and on that same day, two citizens came in to the Police Department who were concerned and said they were going to attend a Commission meeting to demand something be done. One of these persons came to the meeting while the other did not. Dave Waddington asked Charlie Sams if the gang activity is increasing and Charlie Sams said it has over the past three months.

Brett Fuqua said he may get in trouble for what he is about to say, but he is sick and tired of people acting like they do not know that we have a gang issue as Sandusky has had a gang problem for years and the only reason it is getting attention now is because it has gone into the Townships. It is not a black thing or a white thing. He said people should not pretend they did not know about this as it has been going on for years and trickling down into the smaller cities for about the last 10 or 15 years. He said there are people from Cleveland, Detroit and Chicago recruiting our kids and to put blinders on and to say this is happening only in Sandusky is B.S. He said as long as it was not getting out into the townships people could say there is no gang issue. Kim Nuesse said she just came back from teaching Chicago Police Commanders and they have a much larger gang problem than Sandusky and she is not disregarding what our men and women do as she appreciates them. She said they (Chicago) are taking efforts, because they are 500 officers down, in a big city with a major problem, to regionalize services to address the drug and gang problem. She said we have access to a lot of those as well and asked what we are doing to seek them out first before talking about increasing manpower. Charlie Sams said we have regionalized and are working with a regional detective group, have incorporated BCI and are working together. Charlie Sams said unfortunately they are having the same problems that we are and are short staffed. Kim Nuesse asked if Charlie Sams was aware there are federal and state resources in conjunction with local resources that use patrol officers to run intervention while on patrol. She said we could be doing the same thing on a smaller scale. Charlie Sams said we are doing this. Kim Nuesse said if we are not doing this, she has phone numbers for him for the one of the task forces in Cleveland to reassure our citizens there are things we can do to address this issue and that it is not out of control. Charlie Sams said he never did say it was out of control and Kim Nuesse said she appreciated that.

Julie Farrar asked if intervention included car searches and Charlie Sams said they are down to one narcotics detective and road officers assist with these whenever available; they also use county and

other agencies as available. He said we also use the county but they are limited and short staffed as is the BCI and other federal agencies but they are short staffed too and cannot always act on the spur of the moment. Anyone that has ever worked drugs knows they can happen at any time. Kim Nuesse said her point is that we have patrol officers who can be trained to recognize and do intervention on patrol and are fully capable. She understands the investigative part of it but people are concerned about the response time. Charlie Sams said we are doing the reactive work, not the proactive work, and that is the question he answered at the last meeting. Julie Farrar said she recently had a call from a mother whose son was pulled over and his car was searched and the mother felt he was targeted. Julie Farrar reassured her that no one is being picked on and that she (Julie) has a 20-year old and a 17-year old son and they have also been stopped, had their car searched, and this is being done fair across the board; it is not discriminatory and people are doing their job. Dave Waddington said he has a son who received a ticket last week as well. Dan Kaman said the City Commissioners will continue to look at what to do and there are no Commissioners who want to cut in the Police or Fire Department or who think that these employees are not doing their jobs - although he often gets credit for saying this. He said the problem is that in April alone, one of our key revenue indicators was down by \$37,000; another indicator - income tax - is down by \$189,708 for one year. He said he does not care who does it, but something has to change. He said he worked at Sandusky International for 18 years and ten years into it, they made some huge changes and a lot of people went out the door. He said if they had not made these changes, they would now be out of business. He said he saw people who were his friends and people with 30 – 40 years go out the door. He said we are \$189,000 down and that 70% of our budget is for safety services and not one Commissioner wants to make these cuts, but it is a reality and we need help. He said there were recent contract negotiations and something has to change and he is open to anything.

Dan Kaman asked Scott Miller, Kathy McKillips and Charlie Sams where we are with the **impound lot and the paid parking** lot to get some police money in as he has not heard anything about this idea in a month. He said the Commissioners can bring ideas up but it is the staff's responsibility to find the money. He said there is another meeting tomorrow to perhaps establish funding to generate money for the Police Department and it will not be popular. Brett Fuqua said he was involved in this meeting as well and would like some information back one month from today's meeting about the possibility of creating an impound lot to bring revenues into the city for the Police Department. He said some of the towing guys may not be happy but this will bring some revenues in for the Police Department similar to the Fire Department. Don Icsman said this is his responsibility and he will do this.

Don Icsman said it is important to remember we were facing a \$1.7 - \$1.8 million deficit and we knew this well before the first of the year. Our safety forces make up 80% and we should equitably share the pain. Unrepresented people have been cut, have paid more for their insurance and they gave back pay to set an example. Unfortunately, he said we have done the best we could to equitably spread this \$1.8 million around. We have not yet approved the AFSCME agreement and it is no secret there will be more layoffs. As for the study, he said the Chiefs both agree we are looking for an objective tool to help us benefit everyone and he is not married to the ICMA, but as a lawyer, he does not really trust people to do their own study for themselves. He said you have to spend money to get something for it and this takes time and effort and is worth doing it, but you have to be staffed to do this. He said when this was started before, Charlie Sams had the people and we now have very little command staff. He said as for ways to bring people back, the unions can present ideas and we can talk about saving money. It does not matter that the contract was already approved and they can work to correct any miscommunications that occurred. Dan Kaman said he has talked with Officer Hall and Officer Pfanner and told them that the seven commissioners were confident that they had laid off too many people but now, after two months of these numbers, he said we may have not laid off enough. He said it is scary and you can say summer is coming and say how bad things are, but there is not one of the City Commissioners who do not realize this. Don Icsman said even if you get rid of everybody in this building, it would only be about half a million out of the general fund toward the \$1.8 million that was referred to. He said it is not realistic to think that the work can get done without all of these people. He said we still do not have a balanced budget and there is a deficit of a couple hundred thousand dollars and this does not make him happy either. He said there have been savings with the FOP and IAFF contracts - and AFSCME soon - and we hope to erase this and have a balanced budget; we will know more in June.

Kim Nuesse said she wanted to make a point that her motive in bringing forward this study was based on recommendations from other communities as a tool to save money. She said this has been highly touted by City Managers and she plans to make a presentation about it in two weeks.

She said this was brought forward as an idea to explore and if there are other companies out there that do the same thing, this information should also be brought forward. She said she does not appreciate bringing ideas forward only to have them killed because we do not want to look at anything. She said we have to look at whatever tools are out there in an objective manner and it is not personal, it is reality for the citizens of this community. She said you cannot have a city that is just staffed for safety services as people do not want to live in that kind of a community. She said people want their roads fixed, they want leaves picked up and other government services and all employees are important and are part of a team to provide service to the community, not just police and fire. If someone has a grand idea in how to accomplish that, the Commissioners are more than willing to entertain it. She does not appreciate bringing ideas forward only to become a target for criticism; this kills progress and you cannot have progress without change. She said she did not hear any other ideas brought forward and was only making a good suggestion to help. She said this is a responsibility we all have to make our community a better place to be. She said she appreciates Don Icsman supporting this. Julie Farrar said if the Commissioners are to have a study or an analysis performed that we do a Request for Proposals.

Julie Farrar asked Scott Miller for an **update on the status of the signs for the State Champions** and Scott Miller said there has not been more done than what he last showed her.

NEW BUSINESS

Upon motion of Kim Nuesse and second of Dave Waddington, the Commissioners voted to authorize the Clerk of the City Commission, Kelly Kresser, to be the designee for annual Ohio Sunshine Law training on behalf of the Sandusky City Commissioners according to the Ohio Revised Code's education requirement for elected officials.

Discussion: Kim Nuesse said under Ohio's Sunshine Law, all elected officials or their appropriate designees shall attend training approved by the Attorney General as provided in Section 109.43 of the Ohio Revised Code. She said Kelly Kresser recently had this training and could be our designee. Don Icsman said the law first changed a few years ago and Brett Fuqua, Dan Kaman and Dave Waddington would have been covered previously and this would be for those who are newly elected including Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Pervis Brown and John Hamilton.

All Ayes. The President declared the motion passed.

NEW BUSINESS

Upon motion of John Hamilton and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to have an Executive Session regarding Collective Bargaining. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Motion passed.

Upon motion of John Hamilton and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to have an Executive Session regarding Pending Litigation. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Motion passed.

Upon motion of John Hamilton and second of Pervis Brown, the Commission voted to have an Executive Session regarding Pending Litigation. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Kim Nuesse, Julie Farrar, Dave Waddington, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dan Kaman and John Hamilton, 7. The President declared the Motion passed.

Julie Farrar said she has received **complaints about properties that have been condemned asking when they will be torn down, specifically the former Monroe Service Building and a burned house on Carr Street.** She said she has talked with the Law Department and with Carrie Handy and these issues are going through the different hoops necessary for demolition.

Julie Farrar said she wished to make a personal plea, not the Commissions' plea, **for renewing Issue #1, the Third Frontier Program, in the upcoming election.** She said if you could find it in your heart to renew this, Issue #1 is for the Third Frontier Program and will create 48,000 new jobs, attract 637 new companies for Ohio and 41,000 more new jobs by 2014 with an average salary of \$67,000/year.

Under **Audience Participation**, the following persons offered their comments:

Greg Hall, 2140 St. Clair Street, thanked Jeff Krabill and Julie Farrar for attending the recent FOP spaghetti dinner. Greg Hall thanked Brett Fuqua for speaking his mind. He said there is a gang problem in Sandusky and it is even worse than when he was in high school with guns and knives. Greg Hall said the assessment will cost a lot of money and there are other ways to do this. Greg Hall asked Chief Ricci about the EMS fund in the Fire Department and asked Charlie Sams what happens to the warrant service fees. Charlie Sams said this goes into the General Fund and Greg Hall asked if this money could go into a fund for new equipment for the Police Department. Dan Kaman said we would have to look at how these were set up. Paul Ricci said he wished to clarify the first \$150,000 of EMS money goes to the General Fund, a portion goes to PCSO for administrative fees and the remainder goes into the EMS capital fund. Greg Hall said law enforcement officers try to be proactive and do their beats and be visible. He said it is not summertime yet and crime rates are going to go up and we are six officers down. Greg Hall said he applied in mid-March for the city's yard waste program and had materials out for pickup, but now is being told he is not on the list as he did not get in until after April 1 and will have to wait until May. Dan Kaman asked Kelly Kresser if she had information about this and she said that she does not administer this for the city but has the signup form and was asked today to make a revision to it. She said she believed there will be a new cutoff each month as a standard practice and it will be the third Friday of each month for service starting the **next** month and apologized to Greg Hall if this was not made clear.

Willie McCarty, 131 Meigs Street, said there are many activities and events in our parks for our youth and money is available for different things. He said the skate park is a site for events and asked if an electrical outlet could be placed at this location as in the past, he has had to borrow a generator from the Sandusky Fire Department. Willie McCarty said there has been gang activity in Sandusky for years and in 1972 there was a gang called the Meigs Street Posse. He said these gangs now involve our children and grandchildren but there are fewer individuals with guns and these are the individuals needing to be addressed. He said it is what we give these kids as a community that makes them and something needs to be done with our parks to take care of the youth in our community. He said this is not the fault of the children as the gang has given them something to do and something to go home to. He begged for something to be done with our parks. He said there are more rental homes in Sandusky than home owners and lots of vacant properties that have been abandoned and the city is stuck with tearing them down. He said there are responsible citizens in Sandusky and to meet them halfway by selling properties to low income persons/residents. He said the city inspectors are doing something to the elderly in Sandusky that they (the homeowners) cannot afford. He said people should become citizens again and not bicker over pennies. It should not have to come down whether we have a policeman or a fireman, it should come down to necessity. People who are making \$20,000 - \$25,000 but not performing their jobs should be gotten rid of and the ones who are doing their jobs should be taken care of. He said citizens who sit back and watch everyone else are just as guilty. He said United Indians of Ohio and Shining Waters are looking for gang members.

John Ginty, 5055 Providence Drive, asked who would maintain the restrooms at Shoreline Park on the days that staff from Double S will not be working. John Ginty said when Warrenette Parthemore was the heading up the Human Resources Department, a study was done for every city job, both union and non-union. He asked if it was completed and who had a copy. Dan Kaman said this was completed in-house, not by the company initially hired. Don Icsman said the value of the study may not be what you are looking for as we had to sue the guy who started it to get our money back and not to look at it for any beneficial information. Dan Kaman said this was done to define job descriptions. As for the restrooms, Dan Kaman said this will be done by the same persons who are doing it now and to call a city office when there are problems. John Ginty said getting a grant to get one of the cameras moved into this area so the facility is an asset rather than a liability. John Ginty said he has suggested several times that the city look at charging people for other services rendered by the Sandusky Fire Department, besides EMS, that could be paid for by insurance companies. The Police Department could also collect money for accident reports and services. He said someone from Judge Delamatre's court spoke to his Senior Men's group this morning and the problems with our youth. He said it is everyone's responsibility to help.

Rob Pfanner, 609 Broadway Street, said he had an idea for income and whatever he says or does is not personal. He is in support of the Sandusky Police Department for the job they are doing with the staff that they have and has seen this on his own street as a victim of crime. He said he sits on his porch and provides Block Watch and sees the police cruisers coming and going. Recently there was a domestic on his street and when the officer arrived, he asked where his backup was and the

officer told him he **was** the backup. He said there is a crime problem in this town and it is going to get worse and he does not want to see any money spent on a study until an effort is made to bring back at least one police officer with this money. Rob Pfanner asked Kim Nuesse if she trusted the opinion of her department leaders. Kim Nuesse said you (Rob Pfanner) are retired from the Sandusky Police Department and that she would not answer personal questions. Rob Pfanner quoted Dan Kaman from the March 22 meeting saying “. . . we should be careful as this may tell us something we do not want to hear or do . . .” and asked to clarify what he meant by this. Dan Kaman said what he meant was that this could tell us we need twenty more cops, but how could we afford that. He said he would love to have 100 more cops but we cannot afford it. Rob Pfanner said Section 531.16 of the Code of Ordinances covers criminal activity and nuisance laws for excessive consumption of public services including false alarms, drug sales, arrests, raids and excessive trash buildup and could raise money for the Police Department if we start enforcing this Ordinance to its fullest.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, asked why the Commissioners continue to talk about this \$63,000 study as there is no money. Dan Kaman said they are looking for grants to pay for this and Sharon Johnson this is still taxpayer money. Dan Kaman said if other cities are applying for them and getting them, then shouldn't we? Sharon Johnson said it is hard to be efficient when shorthanded and if the city is looking at sewer and water to increase revenues, no ballgame.

Wesley Poole, 1939 East Oldgate, said he is not certain about the CDBG paperwork but it appears that about \$1.7 million was spent and only \$1,000 of this amount was used for youth activities. He said the Commission is looking at spending \$63,000 to find a way to arrest people and to reconsider their spending priorities.

Diedre Cole, 807 Hancock Street, thanked Brett Fuqua and said she comes from Washington, DC, the murder capital of the world and what we (Sandusky) have here is not comparative. She said we have lack of support for people and programs that benefit our children. She said she is dismayed to look at the CDBG grant proposals for \$892,031 and see only \$1,000 spent for our youth. Dr. Richard Koonce and Pastor Tracey Shoemo have started a youth center at Madison School; the Wightman Wieber Foundation supports our children; she, the Police Department, the Fire Department and Commissioners help by sponsoring the Hancock Street block party, but this is not enough. She said \$1,000 is a slap in the face to every parent and child in the community and we must do better. She said we have done an awesome job with our census responses and are at 77% of the national average, but there is a population in Sandusky - from Camp Street to Monroe Street to Sycamore Line - that is only at 68% and if she needs to knock on doors to raise this percentage, she will. She said all of the CDBG funding comes from the census distribution and we need to do better. She said there are abandoned houses but Sandusky will be in the 80's or 90's for the census and how amazing this is. She has been working with the proposal from ICMA and other options for studies and the one thing she has concluded is that we all want the same thing: that which is best for Sandusky. She said we need to have a proactive approach as opposed to a reactive approach and if we need a tool to develop high efficiency levels at our local government level and there is no reason to continue arguing about it. She said we have a parenting problem and we should not be a burden on our safety services but use churches and other available community resources.

Jerry Garrett, Executive Director of the Sandusky Unit of the N.A.A.C.P., commended the Commissioners for taking the bull by the horns and facing some of these thorny problems. He said sometimes more is asked of the Commissioners than they can achieve. Jerry Garrett said there are available resources in the community willing to help with the problems in the Police Department. He said there are efficiency experts that do this every day and even the Charter Review includes citizen participation. He said he is not for those performing the work to do the investigation but does not agree with the cost of an outside consultant. He said there are people who can help analyze this situation and drive it to logical conclusions for the people of Sandusky and not to discount this. He said he is one resource and there are others.

Dan Kaman said the **Charter Review Committee** will meet tomorrow at 5:30 p.m. at City Hall.

Eric Costante, 315 Shelby Street, said he has been a city employee since 2007 and when he came to work here, the city had a motto: "Sandusky was a place to live, work and play". He said as a resident, with decreasing tax dollars, we are doing nothing but diverting away from that by closing the doors on schools, and through the loss of fire and police personnel. He asked what we are doing to bring jobs here for an outside person. He said we should make a deal with anyone wishing to start a business here and once established, they can pay the piper. He said we need to do

something to make us proud again and he is not giving up. He said he would have loved to live here in the 50's when Sandusky was **the** place to be. He has seen the gang issue in his job and learned on CNN today that the City of Chicago is thinking about employing the National Guard to control their gang problem because they cannot.

At 7:27 p.m., Dan Kaman announced adjournment of the regular session for a five minute recess; three Executive Sessions were then held beginning at 7:34 p.m. At 9 p.m., the City Commissioners returned to the table and Dan Kaman declared adjournment.

Kelly L. Kresser
Clerk of the City Commission

Daniel J. Kaman
President of the City Commission